

Message

From: Ungvarsky, John [Ungvarsky.John@epa.gov]
Sent: 8/9/2019 4:24:49 PM
To: King, Scott@ARB [scott.king@arb.ca.gov]
CC: Lueders, Jesse [Lueders.Jesse@epa.gov]; Lee, Anita [Lee.Anita@epa.gov]; Kelly, ThomasP [Kelly.ThomasP@epa.gov]; Sutkus, Carol (carol.sutkus@arb.ca.gov) [carol.sutkus@arb.ca.gov]
Subject: Coachella Valley attainment CM shortfall
Attachments: attainment CM reductions.xlsx

Hi Scott –

Following up on our Weds discussion and emails, I want to share an xl spreadsheet I put together (see attached and table below) analyzing possible statewide measures that might have reductions available in 2027 that *conceptually* might be used to fill the remaining gap in the Coachella Valley attainment contingency measure (and other areas in CA where this might be an issue). A wild card would be insurmountable legal hurdles. Also be any reductions from the SCAQMD measure (currently in the form of a commitment) or any State contingency measure (if and when one is developed) might also come into play. Green shading indicates measures that might provide reductions in 2027 and possibly worthy of discussion. This topic obviously needs more thought, analysis, and discussion, but I think is worth having some initial conversations.

Have a great weekend.

Statewide Measures Adopted	CARB Rule	2023 Reductions in South Coast		Hearing Date	Comment
		NOx	VOC		
Zero-Emission Airport Shuttle Buses	Zero-Emission Airport Shuttle Buses Control System	<0.01		2/21/2019	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Lower In-Use Emission Performance	Warranty Regulation Amendments	0.02		last amended in 2010?	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Not Included in 2016 State Strategy	Portable Equipment Registration Program Regulation	0.25			< 0.01 benefit in CV
Not Included in 2016 State Strategy	Low Carbon Fuel Standard and Alternative Diesel Fuels Regulation	1.7		4/27/2018	possibly 0.1 - 0.2 tpd reductions in 2027?

Not Included in 2016 State Strategy	Crude Oil and Natural Gas Facilities		yes?	7/21/16, 3/23/17	already in baseline? ISOR shows 3,627 tpy VOC reduction statewide
-------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	--	------	------------------	--

Statewide 2016 State Strategy Measures to be Adopted	CARB Rule	NOx	VOC	Adoption	Implementation	Comment
Advanced Clean Cars 2	Advanced Clean Cars 2	-	-	2020 – 2021	2026	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Low-NOx Engine Standard – CA Action	Low-NOx Engine Standard – California Action	-	-	2019	2023	possible small benefit in 2027
Innovative Clean Transit	Innovative Clean Transit	<0.1	<0.1	2017	2018	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Last Mile Delivery	Last Mile Delivery	<0.1	<0.1	2018	2020	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Zero-Emission Off-Road Forklift Regulation Phase 1	Zero-Emission Off-Road Forklift Regulation Phase 1	-	-	2020	2023	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Zero-Emission Airport Ground Support Equipment	Zero-Emission Airport Ground Support Equipment	<0.1	<0.1	2018	2023	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Small Off-Road Engines	Small Off-Road Engines	0.7	7	2018 – 2020	2022	possible small benefit in 2027
Low-Emission Diesel Requirement	Low-Emission Diesel Requirement	0.3	NYQ	by 2020	2023	< 0.01 benefit in CV
Consumer Products Program	Consumer Products Program	0	1-2	2019 – 2021	2020 +	possible small benefit in 2027

John Ungvarsky
Environmental Scientist
USEPA Region IX, Air Division
San Francisco, CA
415-972-3963